



RESEARCH ARTICLE

The Capacity of Sukabumi City’s Municipal Police Unit (Satpol PP) and Fire Department in Enforcing Street Vendor Regulations

Andika Zelin Aji Santoso ¹⁾, Andi Mulyadi ²⁾, Yana Fajar FY Basori ³⁾

Abstract

This study analyzes the capacity of the Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja (Satpol PP) and Pemadam kebakaran (Damkar) of Sukabumi City in enforcing regulations Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL) trading in prohibited areas, as stipulated in Sukabumi City Regional Regulation No. 10 of 2013, Pasal 21. Employing a qualitative descriptive approach, data were gathered through interviews with officials (Cikole, Diskumindag), PKL, residents of R. Syamsudin SH Street, observations, and documentation. Policy capacity was measured using five dimensions from Horton et al. (2003): human resources, infrastructure-technology-financial resources, strategic leadership, program management and implementation processes, and collaboration networks. Findings reveal limitations in human resources (personnel shortages, multifunctional rotations, short operational hours); outdated infrastructure (aging vehicles, limited CCTV, reliance on e-lapor); adaptive strategic leadership via daily briefings and school socialization despite flexible relocations; phased management (persuasion, tiered warnings, UMKM coaching); and inter-agency networks (with Dishub, Police, sub-districts) requiring enhanced joint sweeps in high-risk zones like Ahmad Yani and seven prohibited streets. Key challenges include vendor resistance (high relocation costs), banner damage, budget constraints, and low e-lapor awareness. Recommendations emphasize training enhancements, infrastructure renewal, consistent evaluation cycles, monthly meetings, and digital socialization for sustainable enforcement.

Keyword: : Satpol PP, Regional Regulation (Perda), Capacity, Street Vendors (Pedagang Kaki Lima), PKL Enforcement (Penertiban PKL)

Introduction

Since the enactment of Law Number 7 of 2014 concerning Trade, Street Vendors (PKL) have been recognized as a vital component of Indonesia’s informal economy. Street vendors play a significant role in providing affordable goods and services to the public, creating new employment opportunities, and stimulating the local economy.

The Sukabumi City Government has issued Sukabumi City Regional Regulation Number 10 of 2013 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL). This regulation was established based on the consideration that street vendors, as an informal livelihood, require regulation, empowerment, and management to ensure they do not obstruct traffic, diminish urban aesthetics, or compromise the cleanliness of Sukabumi City’s facilities and infrastructure.

As stated in Article 26: (1) Any person is prohibited from engaging in trade transactions with street vendors in public facilities where business activities or street vendor locations are restricted. Furthermore, Sukabumi City

Regional Regulation Number 10 of 2013, specifically in Article 21, point 11, stipulates that street vendors are prohibited from operating on the following roads: a) Jalan R. Syamsudin, S.H.; b) Jalan R.E. Martadinata; c) Jalan Suryakencana; d) Jalan Siliwangi; e) Jalan Perpustakaan; f) Jalan Perintis Kemerdekaan; and g) Jalan Zaenal Zakse.

Table 1. Data on the Number of Street Vendors in Sukabumi City, 2023

No	Nama Jalan	Jumlah
1.	Jalan Ahmad Yani	119
2.	Jalan Bhayangkara	49
3.	Jalan Bunut (Depan)	34
4.	Jalan Ciwangi	38
5.	Jalan Pasar	68
6.	Jalan Perniagaan	49
7.	Jalan Tipar Gede (Pasar Gudang)	94
8.	Jalan Tipar Gede (Depan Ramayana)	16
9.	Jalan Harun Kabir	104

10.	Jalan Dewi Sartika (Eks Dago)	96
11.	Jalan Pasar Ciwangi	110
12.	Jalan Julius Usman	151
13.	Jalan Lettu Bakri (Barat)	148
14.	Jalan Lettu Bakri (Timur)	199
15.	Jalan Pasundan	122
16.	Jalan Jendral Sudirman	49
17.	Jalan Kenari	10
18.	Jalan Suryakencana	25
19.	Jalan Pelabuhan II	65
20.	Jalan R. Syamsudin, SH	14
21.	Jalan Bunut (Belakang)	30
22.	Jalan Otista	40
23.	Jalan R.A Kosasih	59
24.	Jalan Didi Sukardi	33
Jumlah		1722

Based on the data above, there are 1,722 vendors, 199 of whom operate on East Lettu Bakri Street. The number of street vendors (PKL) is subject to change over time due to the increasing number of traders and the tendency of some vendors to relocate in search of high-traffic areas frequented by the public.

Table 2. Results of Monitoring and Control Activities for Street Vendors (PKL) in Sukabumi City's Red Zones, 2024.

Lokasi	Tahun 2024	
	Oktober	November
Jl. R.E Martadinata	6	4
Jl. H. Juanda	7	
Jl. Syamsudin, S.H	3	6
Jl. Siliwangi	1	5
Jl. Suryakencana		4

Based on the data above, the results of monitoring and control activities conducted by the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) in 2024, in accordance with Sukabumi City Regional Regulation Number 10 of 2013, identified 36 non-compliant street vendors. The highest number of violations occurred on R.E. Martadinata Street, involving 10 vendors. The Sukabumi City Government, through the Public Order Agency, has carried out enforcement measures against vendors operating along prohibited roads as stipulated by the regional regulation. These efforts include administrative

sanctions ranging from the revocation of trading permits to the forceful dismantling of vending stalls by the Public Order Agency.

One of the institutions that plays a crucial role in this context is the Public Order and Fire Services Agency (Satpol PP and Damkar). The Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) is responsible for maintaining public order and enforcing regional regulations, while the Fire Department (Damkar) focuses on fire suppression and rescue efforts. Given the significance of both functions, the merger of Satpol PP and Damkar into a single entity as stipulated in Sukabumi Mayor Regulation Number 150 of 2022 is a strategic move expected to enhance effectiveness and efficiency in public service delivery.

Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja (Satpol PP) plays a vital role in regulating and enforcing Sukabumi City Regional Regulation Number 10 of 2013 concerning the Management and Empowerment of Street Vendors (PKL). One of its primary duties is the supervision and enforcement of regional regulations by monitoring street vendor activities throughout the Sukabumi City area. Satpol PP must ensure that vendors comply with the regulations established by the Sukabumi City Government, particularly regarding prohibited trading locations. Furthermore, the agency is authorized to take action against vendors who violate these provisions, with sanctions ranging from administrative penalties to the dismantling of stalls that do not comply with the regulations.

Furthermore, the effectiveness of street vendor enforcement by the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) is often called into question. Several factors that significantly influence the agency's capacity to carry out these duties include:

- a) Lack of training and skills Polisi Pamong Praja (Satpol PP) members;
 - b) Insufficient budgetary resources.
- Additionally, the resistance encountered from street vendors and the community itself presents a distinct challenge during the regulation and enforcement efforts.

Street vendors frequently feel disenfranchised and neglected by local authorities, leading them to defend their livelihoods even when their activities infringe

upon statutory regulations. Such dynamics often create a state of conflict between the government and the public.

Method

This research was conducted at the Sukabumi City Public Order and Fire Services Agency. The study employs a qualitative research method. The data collection techniques utilized include observation, interviews, documentation, as well as audio and visual media. The primary objective and indicator of this research is to examine the capacity of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) and Fire Department (Damkar) in regulating street vendors (PKL) operating within prohibited zones in Sukabumi City.

The sampling technique employed in this research is non-probability sampling, specifically snowball sampling. This technique involves selecting data sources that initially start small in number and gradually expand over time. The data analysis process consists of several stages: processing the data, reading through the data, coding, describing themes, and providing interpretation and meaning.

Results and Discussion

How is the capacity of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) and Fire Department (Damkar) in regulating street vendors (PKL) operating within prohibited trading zones in Sukabumi City?

According to Horton et al. (2003), organizational capacity is defined as an organization's ability to achieve superior performance by applying available skills and resources to realize objectives and meet stakeholder expectations. Based on the information obtained regarding the capacity of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) and Fire Department (Damkar) in regulating street vendors (PKL) operating in prohibited zones within Sukabumi City, the findings are as follows:

"Our personnel are divided into six daily shifts, but only three are active at any given time: one for general patrol, one stationed at public areas, and one preparing for night duty. There is no specialized unit for street vendors (PKL)

due to budget constraints and the fact that our mandate covers the entire city. Consequently, effectiveness is low as we cannot maintain a 24-hour presence in red zones. Furthermore, our working hours are limited to 4:00 PM from Monday to Thursday and 4:30 PM on Friday; any duties beyond those hours are considered paid overtime."

Subsequently, the researcher conducted interviews with Informants 2 and 3, whose responses aligned with the previous findings. Based on the interviews with Informants 1, 2, and 3, it can be interpreted that the Human Resources indicator of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency's (Satpol PP) capacity remains limited. The agency operates with only six squads with only three active daily on a rotational basis to cover extensive citywide duties such as general patrols, stationed duty at Lapangan Merdeka, and night shifts. These constraints are further exacerbated by short operational hours (until 4:00 PM Monday-Thursday and 4:30 PM on Friday) and a limited overtime budget. Consequently, monitoring has become ineffective; patrols often turn into a 'cat-and-mouse' game with street vendors who relocate quickly, and enforcement remains reliant on repetitive minor offense proceedings (Tipiring).

These findings reinforce the premise that human resource strengthening involves more than just increasing headcount; it encompasses professionalism-based recruitment mechanisms, a balanced allocation of responsibilities, and routine competency development programs as formulated by Horton et al. (2003). Furthermore, the establishment of designated street vendor centers (centers of PKL) presents a comprehensive opportunity to minimize the need for coercive enforcement.

According to Horton et al. (2003), the dimensions of infrastructure, information technology, and financial resources serve as fundamental pillars that substantially strengthen an organization's foundational capacity. These dimensions include the readiness of physical infrastructure in the form of adequate operational facilities, the utilization of technology for workflow optimization and data-driven decision-making, and financial management that is transparent, efficient, and accountable. Synergistically, these elements ensure the smooth

implementation of organizational programs and the achievement of long-term strategic goals. Consequently, infrastructure constitutes a vital aspect of street vendor regulation in Sukabumi City.

Based on in-depth interviews conducted with the Public Order (Trantib) and Regional Regulation Enforcement (Gakda) divisions of the Sukabumi City Satpol PP regarding organizational capacity specifically concerning indicators of Infrastructure, Technology, and Financial Resources in the context of street vendor enforcement the following findings were obtained:

"We use various freight and passenger vehicles such as trucks and small buses—for our daily operations. However, during minor offense proceedings (TIPIRING), we use specialized vehicles. Regarding our needs, we certainly hope for more. Some of our trucks are quite old and require rejuvenation and better maintenance. Ideally, we would have additional equipment and upgrades, but we are realistic about our current situation. For now, we maximize what we have and continue working hard, while remaining hopeful for future budget improvements."

Based on the interviews regarding the infrastructure of the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) in regulating street vendors within prohibited zones, it can be concluded that the operational fleet primarily consists of freight trucks and small buses for daily activities, while specialized vehicles are reserved for minor offense proceedings (TIPIRING). The current fleet is considered outdated, necessitating rejuvenation and intensive maintenance; however, personnel realistically maximize existing resources through diligent effort while remaining hopeful for additional budget or support for the procurement of more adequate new vehicles.

Furthermore, leadership at the organizational level plays a vital role in orienting overall organizational goals. Strategic leadership is closely linked to organizational vision—specifically, the ability to create unique characteristics for the organization (Horton, 2003).

Based on in-depth interviews with the Public Order (Trantib) and Regional Regulation Enforcement (Gakda) divisions of the Sukabumi

City Satpol PP regarding organizational capacity findings particularly concerning the strategic leadership indicator in the context of street vendor enforcement the following findings were obtained:

"Since Satpol PP is a unified unit, our mindset must be synchronized. Regarding strategy, there are elements that belong to the 'world of ideas' and those that belong to implementation. Our goal is to ensure that the vision remains closely aligned with the practice. Often, things look good in theory, on paper, or in legal fiction; therefore, we strive to bridge the gap between that 'vision in the clouds' and reality. What is our strategy? First, we hold daily morning briefings unlike other departments that might not do this every day. In Satpol PP, it is a daily routine followed by evaluations after every task. That is our routine strategy. For our long-term strategy, we plan and execute our vision by targeting the future; for instance, today's junior high school students will be the ones responsible for public order in a few years. So, we conduct outreach in schools as an early mitigation effort through 'Satpol PP Goes to School.' Every program must follow that cycle: preparation, implementation, supervision, and evaluation. We continuously strive for improvement, even though achieving perfection can be quite difficult."

Based on the aforementioned explanation, it can be concluded that strategic leadership within the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) emphasizes the alignment of a unified mindset among personnel to bridge the 'world of ideas' comprising strategic planning, legal documentation, and long-term vision with the realities of field implementation. This approach aims to narrow the gap between ideal concepts and operational reality. This strategy is manifested through daily routines, such as mandatory morning briefings (which distinguish the agency from other departments) and consistent post-task evaluations to ensure operational consistency. Meanwhile, the long-term approach includes preventive programs such as 'Satpol PP Goes To School,' which targets junior high school students as future stakeholders in public order through early socialization and risk mitigation. Each program is managed through a comprehensive cycle spanning meticulous preparation, directed

implementation, and strict supervision to periodic evaluation for continuous improvement, although the informant acknowledges the ongoing challenges in achieving ideal perfection.

This leadership approach within Satpol PP deeply reflects the essence of strategic leadership as defined by Horton et al. (2003), which positions the leader as the primary architect in unraveling the complexities of the external environment, such as the recurring dynamics of street vendors (PKL). This is achieved through a concrete daily assessment process via morning briefings, where field issues are directly interpreted into tactical directives aligned with the organization's long-term vision. Furthermore, the routine post-task evaluations illustrate the strategic direction capability described by Horton et al. (2003)—namely, the leader's ability to not only set abstract goals but also ensure accountability through continuous feedback that bridges the idealism of legal documentation with operational realities filled with unpredictable variables, such as vendor resistance.

Moreover, the 'Satpol PP Goes To School' program serves as a tangible manifestation of Horton et al.'s (2003) 'external influence and coordination' dimension. Here, leadership is not confined to internal organizational boundaries but proactively builds alliances with the school community to create a long-term ripple effect: the cultivation of a younger generation conscious of public order. This transforms external threats (potential future violations) into opportunities for social capacity building. The complete cycle of preparation, implementation, supervision, and evaluation in every initiative also reflects the dynamic strategic flexibility mentioned by Horton et al. (2003). This allows leaders to navigate resource constraints by optimizing daily routines as the organization's 'adaptation engine,' enabling Satpol PP to remain resilient against urban challenges like seasonal street vendor migration while maintaining public legitimacy through measured process transparency.

According to Horton et al. (2003), within the framework of government organizational capacity, the dimension of Program Management and Implementation Processes comprehensively measures a public

organization's ability to effectively and efficiently plan, implement, supervise, and evaluate strategic programs. This involves integrated internal resource management including human resources (HR), finance, technological infrastructure, and physical assets and the optimization of daily workflows that are fully aligned with the organization's overall mission and vision.

Regarding the interviews conducted by the researcher with the Regional Regulation Enforcement and Public Order and Security divisions of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) concerning organizational capacity findings specifically the Program Management and Implementation Process indicators the findings are as follows:

"The Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) for regulating street vendors (PKL) is stipulated in the Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation (Permendagri) of 2023. Before we take any enforcement action, there are mandatory stages of persuasion, followed by warnings and socialization all of which are clearly outlined in that regulation. If a violation is discovered, we provide a seven-day period for the vendor to rectify the situation. If they remain in violation after those seven days, we issue formal warning letters: the first warning lasts for three days, the second for two days, and the third for one day. Only after these stages are completed do we proceed with enforcement. The SOP follows these step-by-step stages to ensure fairness and compliance with the regulations."

An interview with a representative from the Public Order (Trantib) division of the Sukabumi City Satpol PP revealed the implementation of Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for street vendor enforcement, formally codified in the 2023 Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation. This regulation emphasizes a gradual and humanistic approach prior to strict enforcement, beginning with persuasion and socialization to build awareness. This is followed by an initial seven-day rectification period and a graded warning system comprising a three-day first warning, a two-day second warning, and a one-day third warning before final enforcement action is taken. This reflects the organization's commitment to the principles of procedural

justice and measurable, transparent regulatory compliance.

This process explicitly illustrates the dimension of Program Management and Implementation Processes according to Horton et al. (2003) through a complete cycle of preparation, implementation (graded warnings), supervision, and evaluation. This ensures that daily workflows align with the law enforcement mission while accommodating social empathy toward street vendors. The codification of the Ministry's regulation provides a measurable framework that reduces the subjective discretion of field officers, thereby enhancing accountability and public legitimacy.

Furthermore, the dimension of Networking and External Relations plays a crucial role in strengthening organizational capacity, as outlined by Horton (2003). Networking is defined as an organization's ability to build strategic relationships with both internal and external stakeholders to achieve objectives effectively. This capacity reflects the organization's ability to collaborate and interact with other agencies and the broader community, which is vital for supporting overall success. Consequently, this aspect of capacity represents the management of strategic external relations that must be continuously developed and improved by the organization.

Based on interviews conducted with the Regional Regulation Enforcement and Public Order and Security divisions of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) regarding Networking and External Relations, the findings are as follows:

"In our street vendor enforcement operations, we involve the Transportation Agency (Dishub) for traffic management and monitoring of high-risk zones; the Sukabumi City Police, specifically the Traffic Police (Polantas), for security and mediating potential conflicts with vendors; and the Cooperative, SME, and Trade Agency (DKUKMP) as the leading sector for vendor facilitation. Furthermore, we coordinate with Cikole District officials for regional coordination and local socialization, and occasionally involve the local Military District Command (Babinsa/Koramil) if there is a potential for mass gatherings." The informant interviews reveal a structured cross-institutional

cooperation network in street vendor (PKL) enforcement operations. This collaboration involves the Transportation Agency (Dishub) for traffic management and high-risk zone monitoring; the Sukabumi City Police (Polantas) for security and conflict mediation; the Cooperative, SME, and Trade Agency as the leading sector for vendor assistance; and the local Military District Command (Babinsa/Koramil) in situations involving potential mass gatherings. This reflects the Networking and External Relations dimension by Horton et al. (2003), wherein the organization builds strategic internal and external relationships to achieve integrated operational effectiveness.

Such cross-sector coordination not only enhances operational efficiency in the field but also strengthens the public legitimacy of the Satpol PP through process transparency involving multiple actors. This creates a long-term impact by preventing seasonal street vendor violations and strengthening the social capacity of the Sukabumi community through a sustainable, collaborative approach.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Based on the research findings, interviews, and the analysis of all organizational capacity dimensions as defined by Horton et al. (2003), it can be concluded that the capacity of the Sukabumi City Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) in regulating street vendors (PKL) has operated in accordance with the regulatory frameworks of Regional Regulation (Perda) No. 10 of 2013 and the 2023 Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation (Permendagri); however, it has not yet reached full optimality or sustainability. While enforcement has been conducted through persuasive approaches, gradual socialization, cross-institutional coordination, and SME development programs, it remains hindered by various structural and operational constraints.

In the human resources dimension, the limited number of personnel, disproportionate task allocation, and relatively short operational hours have led to inconsistent enforcement effectiveness, resulting in a 'cat-and-mouse' pattern with vendors. Regarding infrastructure, technology, and financial resources, the aging fleet, limited monitoring technology such as

CCTV, and the lack of a dedicated integrated budget for PKL management restrict the scope and sustainability of oversight. The strategic leadership dimension demonstrates commendable adaptive and preventive efforts through daily briefings, routine evaluations, and educational programs, yet it still requires strengthening in the consistency of the planning, implementation, supervision, and evaluation (PISE) cycle.

Furthermore, regarding program management and implementation processes, Satpol PP has applied normative enforcement stages and prioritized public awareness, although the effectiveness of formal sanctions, such as minor offense proceedings (Tipiring), is hampered by budget limitations. Meanwhile, in the networking and cooperation dimension, cross-institutional coordination is well-established and visible through joint 'sweeping' operations and persuasive appeals. However, it still faces vendor resistance due to high relocation costs, damaged socialization facilities, and low public literacy regarding digital complaint channels like *e-lapor*.

Overall, the organizational capacity of the Sukabumi City Satpol PP in PKL regulation is categorized as 'fairly good' but not yet optimal. Therefore, integrated strengthening is required across human resources, infrastructure and technology, strategic leadership, program management, as well as cross-institutional networking and public participation. Such strengthening is a primary prerequisite for realizing PKL regulation that is well-directed, humanistic, and sustainable.

Based on these research findings, the following recommendations are proposed to enhance the capacity for street vendor regulation:

- a) **Strengthening Human Resources:** "Increase the allocation of specialized personnel for street vendor (PKL) management by adding at least two dedicated squads focused on high-risk zones; reduce multi-functional rotation through structural task restructuring. Furthermore, extend daily operational hours until 6:00 PM using a performance-based incentive overtime scheme, complemented by monthly technical training on managing vendor resistance.
- b) **Optimizing Infrastructure, Technology, and Finance:** "Conduct a phased rejuvenation of the operational fleet through the 2026 Regional Budget (APBD); allocate a dedicated budget for the installation of 10 CCTV units across 7 red zones, integrated into a real-time dashboard with the *e-lapor* system for 24-hour monitoring. Additionally, diversify funding sources through provincial grants to subsidize street vendor relocation and ensure transparent accountability via quarterly reports.
- c) **Enhancing Strategic Leadership:** Institutionalize daily morning briefings combined with post-task evaluations to align strategic planning with field realities. Furthermore, scale up the 'Satpol PP Goes To School' program to primary and secondary schools by implementing public order awareness modules, followed by long-term impact monitoring through student surveys.
- d) **Reforming Program Management and Implementation Processes:** Collaborate with the SME Agency to facilitate mass Business Identification Number (NIB) registration for street vendors; measure success through a 'Public Awareness Index' via monthly surveys rather than the number of minor offense proceedings (Tipiring). Consistently apply the graded warning cycle as mandated by the 2023 Ministry of Home Affairs Regulation (7-3-2-1 days) with structured manual recording to ensure strict procedural compliance. Additionally, conduct periodic inter-agency evaluations focusing on field feedback, accompanied by intensive socialization campaigns in priority enforcement areas.
- e) **Strengthening External Cooperation Networks:** Institutionalize monthly task force meetings involving the Transportation Agency (Dishub), Traffic Police (Polantas), district officials, and local military officers (Babinsa) to ensure coordinated morning sweeping operations. Enhance the promotion of digital complaint channels through neighborhood units (RW/RT) and local communities to encourage broader public participation. Furthermore, develop cooperation with relevant stakeholders to facilitate sustainable relocation, monitoring effectiveness through shared indicators to

reduce recidivism or recurring violations. Finally, establish official, rent-free integrated street vendor centers on government-owned land, equipped with basic free facilities such as kiosks, sanitation, and electricity.

References

- Hughes, O. E. (2012). Public Management and Administration. In *Public Management and Administration*.
- Satibi. (2012). Manajemen Publik Dalam Perspektif Teoritik dan Empirik. *Unpas Press*,
- Horton, D., Alexaki, A., Bennett-lartey, S., Brice, K. N., Campilan, D., Carden, F., Silva, J. D. S., Duong, L. T., Khadar, I., Boza, A. M., Muniruzzaman, I. K., Perez, J., Chang, M. S., Vernooy, R., & Watts, J. (2003). Evaluating Capacity Development Experiences from Research and Development Organizations around the World: The Netherlands International Service for National Agricultural Research (ISNAR), International Development Research Centre (IDRC-Canada) and the Neth. International Service for National Agricultural Research (ISNAR), the Netherlands; International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Canada; and ACP-EU Technical Centre for Agricultural and Rural Cooperation (CTA), the Netherlands.
- Millet, J. D. (1954). *Management in the Public Service: The Quest for Effective Performance*. McGraw-Hill.
- Pollitt, C., & Bouckaert, G. (2017). *Public Management Reform: A Comparative Analysis—Into the Age of Austerity*. Oxford University Press.
- Creswell, J. W. (2016). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage Publications.
- Sugiono. (2019). *Metode penelitian kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Moleong, L. J. (2017). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif*. Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Hughes, O. E. (2012). Public Management and Administration. In *Public Management and Administration*.
- Satibi. (2012). Manajemen Publik Dalam Perspektif Teoritik dan Empirik. *Unpas Press*,
- Haidar, A. (2011). Kapasitas organisasi: Pengembangan dan efektivitas. *Jurnal Manajemen dan Kewirausahaan*